

PLANNING COMMITTEE

MINUTES

8 DECEMBER 2010

Chairman: Councillor Keith Ferry

Councillors: * Mrinal Choudhury

Joyce Nickolay Graham Henson (1) * Anthony Seymour Nizam Ismail (4) Simon Williams (1)

Denotes Member present

(1) and (4) Denote category of Reserve Members

66. **Attendance by Reserve Members**

RESOLVED: To note the attendance at this meeting of the following duly appointed Reserve Members:-

Ordinary Member Reserve Member

Councillor Simon Williams Councillor Stephen Greek Councillor Thaya Idaikkadar Councillor Graham Henson Councillor William Stoodley Councillor Nizam Ismail

67. **Right of Members to Speak**

RESOLVED: That, in accordance with Committee Procedure Rule 4.1, the following Councillor, who was not a Member of the Committee, be allowed to speak on the agenda item indicated:

Councillor Planning Application

Stephen Greek 2/02 - 647 Kenton Lane, Harrow, HA3 6AS

68. Declarations of Interest

RESOLVED: To note that the following interest was declared:

<u>Agenda Item 10 – Planning Applications Received – 1/04 1-14 & 15-38 Swift Close and 1-8 & 9-16 Drinkwater Road, Rayners Lane Estate, Harrow, HA2 0TH</u>

Councillor Graham Henson declared a personal interest in that he was on the committee of the Home Group as a Council nominee. He would remain in the room whilst the matter was considered and voted upon.

69. Minutes

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the meeting held on 17 November 2010 be taken as read and signed as a correct record subject to the insertion of 'in Hatch End where he lives' at the end of the first sentence of paragraph five in minute 58 regarding the declaration of interest by Councillor Anthony Seymour.

70. Public Questions, Petitions and Deputations

RESOLVED: To note that no public questions were put, or petitions or deputations received at this meeting under the provisions of Committee Procedure Rules 17, 15 and 16 respectively.

71. References from Council and other Committees/Panels

There were none.

72. Representations on Planning Applications

RESOLVED: That in accordance with the provisions of Committee Procedure Rule 30 (Part 4B of the Constitution), representations be received in respect of items 2/04 and 2/06 on the list of planning applications.

RESOLVED ITEMS

73. Planning Applications Received

In accordance with the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985, the Addendum was admitted late to the agenda as it contained information relating to various items on the agenda and was based on information received after the despatch of the agenda. It was admitted to the agenda in order to enable Members to consider all information relevant to the items before them for decision.

RESOLVED: That authority be given to the Divisional Director of Planning to issue the decision notices in respect of the applications considered.

FORMER GOVERNMENT OFFICES, HONEYPOT LANE, STANMORE, HA7 1BB (APPLICATION 1/01)

Reference: P/2360/10 – (Adunni Adams (A2Dominion Housing). Modify Section 106 Agreement To Planning Permission P/2317/06/CFU Dated 13/7/2007 To Change The Tenure Of A Two Bed Affordable Flat From A Social Rented Unit To A Shared Ownership Unit.

In response to a question it was noted that the flat was under construction. The distribution of affordable housing had been calculated on a percentage basis and had resulted in only one property in the block being affordable. Therefore the level of service charge would be disproportionately higher than the other social rented units in the development.

DECISION:

- (1) GRANTED modification of the Section 106 Agreement described on the application and submitted plans, subject to the conditions and informatives reported and the applicant entering into a deed of variation with the Heads of Terms set out in the report;
- (2) the Divisional Director of Planning, in consultation with the Director of Legal and Governance Services, be delegated to seal the S106 agreement and to agree any minor amendments to the conditions or the legal agreement.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

KODAK SITE HEADSTONE DRIVE WEALDSTONE, HA1 4TY (APPLICATION 1/02)

Reference: P/2117/10 – (Land Securities). Variation Of Condition 5 Attached To Planning Permission P/1795/09 Dated 17/12/2009 To Be Changed From Market On Fridays To Market On Tuesdays.

The officer reported that the current planning permission expired in January 2011.

DECISION: GRANTED variation of condition 5 described on the application and submitted plans, subject to conditions reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the variation was unanimous.

27 PINNER PARK GARDENS, HARROW, HA2 6LQ (APPLICATION 1/03)

Reference: P/2279/10 – (Mr Eric Gadsden). Demolition Of Nos. 27-30 Pinner Park Gardens And The Construction Of 13 Two Storey Houses; Associated Landscaping New Vehicle Access Parking And Refuse Storage.

The officer reported that a site visit had taken place. In response to questions from Members it was noted that:

- the application was before the Committee due to public interest;
- the provision of parking spaces was in line with policy;
- the threshold for affordable houses was ten or more dwellings unless the applicant could demonstrate why it was not feasible. A Section 106 Agreement could enable provision to be made offsite;
- Policy PPS3 did not prevent development on garden land but required the character of the area to be taken into account:
- the application currently before the Committee did not include a proposal to widen the access road to the site.

DECISION: REFUSED permission for the development described in the application and submitted plans, as amended by the addendum, for the reasons reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to refuse the application was unanimous.

1-14 & 15-38 SWIFT CLOSE AND 1-8 & 9-16 DRINKWATER ROAD, RAYNERS LANE ESTATE, HARROW, HA2 0TH (APPLICATION 1/04)

Reference: P/2854/10 – (Home Group). Variation To Condition 23 (Approved Plans) Attached To Planning Permission P/0405/10 Dated 20/07/2010 For Demolition Of Four Existing Blocks Of Flats And The Construction Of 55 Private Residential Dwellings As Part Of The Rayners Lane Estate Regeneration; Comprising 2 X 3 Bed Houses, 17 X 2 Bed Houses, 22 X 2 Bed Apartments And 14 X 1 Bed Apartments; The Provision Of Landscaping, Refuse And 54 Car Parking Spaces To Reduce The Width Of Upper Floor (Second And Third Floor) Level Access Walkways Within The Southern Elevation Of Building "F2".

The officer reported that the variation was materially different to the approved scheme. In response to a question it was noted that the level access walkways were outside the main wall of the building.

DECISION: GRANTED permission for the variation of condition 23 as described on the application and submitted plans, as amended by the addendum, subject to conditions and informatives reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the variation was unanimous.

PETERBOROUGH COTTAGE, PETERBOROUGH ROAD, HARROW, HA1 3DY (APPLICATION 2/01)

Reference: P/1976/10 – (Harrow School). Realignment And Resurfacing Of Part Of Garlands Lane; And New Pedestrian Path And Replacement Fencing

DECISION: GRANTED permission for the development described on the application and submitted plans, subject to conditions and informatives reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

647 KENTON LANE, HARROW, HA3 6AS (APPLICATION 2/02)

Reference: P/2855/10 – (M & K Builders Ltd). Demolition Of Existing Building; Redevelopment To Provide Detached Three Storey Building Comprising Eight Self Contained Flats; Landscaping; Refuse Storage And Associated Parking; 2.1m High Boundary Fence.

The officer reported that a site visit had taken place. In response to questions from Members it was noted that:

- Russell Mead was the sole block of flats in the immediate area, there
 were other flats and terraced houses within a short distance of the site,
 as could also be seen from the OS map;
- it was already a mixed area with a variety of schemes.

DECISION: REFUSED permission for the development described in the application and submitted plans, as amended by the addendum, for the following reasons:

- 1. The proposed development, by reason of the number of units proposed, the contemporary design, bulk and massing, is considered to be an overdevelopment of the site, and would be detrimental to the character and appearance of the immediate area which is predominantly characterised by traditional semi-detached dwellings, contrary to Planning Policy Statement 3: Housing (2010), policies 4B.1 and 4B.8 of the London Plan (2008), saved policies D4 and D5 of the Harrow Unitary Development Plan (2004) and the adopted Supplementary Planning Guidance, Designing New Development (2003); and
- 2. The proposed development, by reason of the insufficient off-street car parking provision, would result in a detrimental impact on the safety and convenience of users of the adjacent public highway, contrary to Planning Policy Guidance Note 13: Transport (2001) and saved policy T13 of the Harrow Unitary Development Plan (2004).

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to refuse the application was unanimous.

LAND ADJACENT 269 WATFORD ROAD, HARROW (APPLICATION 2/03)

Reference: P/2457/10 – (Mr Ali Musani). Extension Of Time To Planning Permission P/136/05/CFU Dated 09/09/2005 For 'Demolition Of Existing Commercial Building, And Development Of Replacement Detached Building To Accommodate Pool And Gym For Use In Conjunction With Adjacent Dwelling House'.

The officer reported that the application was submitted to Committee as it was a departure from the Development Plan as it was Metropolitan Open Land. The application was for an extension of time and there had been no significant changes in policy since the original application was approved and the site circumstances remained the same.

DECISION: GRANTED permission for the development described on the application and submitted plans, as amended by the addendum, subject to conditions and informatives reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

THE POWERHOUSE, 87 WEST STREET, HARROW, HA1 3EL (APPLICATION 2/04)

Reference: P/2444/10 – (Orchard Associates). Second Floor Extension To Form Additional Office Suite.

The officer reported that the previous planning permission had expired so it had not been possible to seek an extension of time. The Chairman stated that the Planning Inspector would take into account that the application had been approved previously so it would be necessary to ascertain if there had been material changes.

In response to questions from Members it was noted that:

- the air conditioning was positioned on the fascia of the current building so was not affected by the application. Any change would require a separate application;
- the site had sufficient parking and the applicant allowed residents access to the car park;
- the surrounding roads were parked to capacity which worked as a parking deterrent. The extent of the extension was below the threshold for a formal travel plan. The increase in traffic flow was considered to be an insignificant increase to current traffic flows.

It was moved and seconded that the application be refused for the following reason:

'The proposal constitutes excessive development of this sensitive site in a conservation area by reason of its overbearing height and overlooking of the rear of properties in Nelson Road contrary to policy D14.'

The refusal was put to the vote and lost.

The Committee received representations from an objector, Michael Gollings, and a representative of the applicant, John Orchard.

DECISION: GRANTED permission for the development described on the application and submitted plans, subject to conditions and informatives reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the voting was as follows:

Councillors Choudhury, Ferry, Henson and Ismail voted to grant the application.

Councillors Nickolay, Seymour and Williams voted against the decision to grant the application.

STANMORE HALL WOOD LANE, STANMORE, HA7 4JY (APPLICATION 2/05)

Reference: P/2124/10 – (Stanmore Hall Management Company). Proposal: Replacement Tiling On Rear Terrace.

DECISION: GRANTED listed building consent for the development described on the application and submitted plans, subject to conditions and informatives reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

JOHN LYON MIDDLE SCHOOL, MIDDLE ROAD, HARROW, HA2 0HN (APPLICATION 2/06)

Reference: P/2160/10 – (Mr Michael Gibson). Two Storey Extension To Existing Main Building To Provide Catering Facilities And Dining Room; Alterations To Existing Old Building To Facilitate Use As Sixth Form Centre; Associated Landscaping.

In response to questions from Members it was noted that:

- the Section 106 Agreements in force on the site restricted the pupil numbers to 600 maximum, there were no proposals within the application to increase that number;
- the scheme included the relocation of the sixth form from a site across the road;

- six out of hours car parking spaces would be lost due to the extension to the catering block;
- it was an active site out of hours with informal on site parking;
- the Committee could not consider the long term intentions of the applicants but was required to respond to applications as submitted.

The Committee received a representation from an objector, Mrs Eileen Kinnear. In response to questions raised by the objector, it was agreed to:

- request the school to make the development plan available;
- to provide the objector with the increase in footprint resulting from each previously approved and implemented scheme and the current application.

It was moved and seconded that the application be refused for the following reasons 'This proposal represents an overdevelopment of an already crowded site in an area of special character in Roxeth Hill and crosses the border of the building envelope contrary to Policy D14'. Upon being put to the vote the motion for refusal was lost.

DECISION:

- (1) GRANTED permission for the development described on the application and submitted plans, subject to: conditions and informatives reported; the completion of a variation to the Section 106 Agreement dated 23 June 1995 within six months of the Committee resolution;
- the delegation of authority to the Divisional Director of Planning in consultation with the Director of Legal and Governance Services for the sealing of the Section 106 deed by variation and to agree any minor amendments to the conditions if necessary to allow the scheme subject of this report to be constructed outside the building envelope shown edged red on drawing 977/31/B annexed to the 1995 agreement; and the payment of a monitoring contribution of £500 and the Council's reasonable legal costs to prepare the deed of variation;
- (3) should the Section 106 Agreement not be completed within six months of the date of the Planning Committee, the decision to REFUSE planning permission be delegated to the Divisional Director of Planning for the reason set out in the report.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the voting was as follows:

Councillors Choudhury, Ferry and, Henson voted to grant the application.

Councillors Nickolay, Seymour and Williams voted against the decision to grant the application.

The Chairman used his casting vote to grant the application.

CHAPEL, 201 HIGH STREET, HARROW, HA1 3HT (APPLICATION 2/07)

Reference: P/2673/10 – (Harrow School). Listed Building Consent: Replacement Lighting And Wiring Within The Church.

The officer reported that the application had been submitted to the Committee as it related to a Grade II* listed building. In response to a question it was noted that the details of the electrical installation was a building regulations matter and therefore not for consideration by the Committee.

DECISION: GRANTED listed building consent for the development described on the application and submitted plans, subject to conditions and informatives reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

UNIVERSITY OF WESTMINSTER, WATFORD ROAD, HARROW, HA1 3TP (APPLICATION 4/01)

Reference: P/3091/10 – (London Borough of Brent). Consultation From Neighbouring Borough: Hybrid Planning Application For The Demolition Of Part Of The University Of Westminster's Harrow Campus And The Erection Of New Buildings And Refurbishment Of Existing Buildings, Comprising: Full Planning Permission For The Demolition Of 6,980m² Of Existing Floor Space And The Erection Of 3,435m² Of New Educational Floor Space (Use Class D1) In New Buildings Ranging In Height From One To Two Storeys, The Refurbishment Of Existing Buildings, Including New External Cladding, New Hard And Soft Landscaping, Improvements To The Entrance Adjacent To Northwick Park Underground Station And Construction Of A Multi-Use Games Area; And Outline Planning Permission For A Further 3,545m² Of New Educational Floor Space (Matters To Be Approved: Land Use, Quantum Of Development And Means Of Access, With Layout, Scale, Appearance And Landscaping Reserved).

DECISION: NO OBJECTION raised.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision was unanimous.

GARAGES REAR OF 62-68 DABBS HILL LANE, NORTHOLT, UB5 4DA (APPLICATION 4/02)

Reference: P/3109/10 – (London Borough of Ealing). Consultation From Neighbouring Authority: Demolition Of 41 Existing Derelict Garages Adjacent To Northolt Park And Sited To The Rear Of No. 62 -68 Dabbs Hill And The Erection Of Ten Affordable Two-Storey Terraced And Semi-Detached Houses (1x 2-Bedroom 7x 3-Bedroom And 2x 4-Bedroom) Incorporating Communal Amenity Space, Car And Cycle Parking, Refuse And Recycling Storage, Rear Private Amenity Space, With Site Access Gained From Dabbs Hill Lane.

DECISION: NO OBJECTION raised.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision was unanimous.

LAND ACROSS FROM 89 FRANCIS ROAD, HARROW, HA1 2RA (APPLICATION 5/01)

Reference: P/3056/10 – (Telefonica 02 (Uk) Ltd). Prior Approval Of Siting And Appearance: 15m High Telecommunications Mast With Associated Equipment Cabinets.

DECISION: That

- (1) prior approval was required;
- (2) REFUSE prior approval of siting and appearance for the development as described in the application and submitted plans for the reason stated in the report.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision was unanimous.

LAND FRONTING 61 IMPERIAL DRIVE, NORTH HARROW, HA2 7DT (APPLICATION 5/02)

Reference: P/3058/10 (Telefonica 02 (UK) Ltd). Prior Approval Of Siting And Appearance: 15m High Telecommunications Mast With Associated Equipment Cabinets.

DECISION: That

- (1) prior approval was required;
- (2) REFUSE prior approval of siting and appearance for the development as described in the application and submitted plans for the reason stated in the report.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision was unanimous.

74. Information Report - Planning Appeal Decisions

The Committee received a report of the Divisional Director of Planning which provided an overview of planning appeal decisions in the first six months of 2010/11.

It was noted that Members of the Committee and Reserves would receive information on planning appeals, enforcement notices and undetermined applications on which pre-application advice had been received. The appeals and enforcement information would be made available to any Member who so requested.

RESOLVED: That the report be noted.

75. Member Site Visits

RESOLVED: To note that there were no site visits to be arranged arising from the meeting.

(Note: The meeting, having commenced at 6.30 pm, closed at 8.12 pm).

(Signed) COUNCILLOR KEITH FERRY Chairman